THE QUALITY OF GROWTH
THE QUALITY OF GROWTH
A Note about the Cover

Future: Bright or Dark! by Maja Sasek, age 12, Skopje, FYR Macedonia.

The future is a chance you should take. It is a creation and everyone has his or her own vision. It will look the way we make it look.

—Maja Sasek

Over 5,000 children and students from Albania, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Bulgaria, FYR Macedonia, and Romania took part in art and essay contests on their vision of the future for themselves, their cities, and their countries and regions. A selection of their paintings was displayed in an exhibit entitled “Children Look to the Horizon,” which was shown at the World Bank, Washington, D.C., April 1999; in Vienna, Austria, September 1999; and in Florence, Italy, October 1999.
THE QUALITY OF GROWTH

Vinod Thomas
Mansoor Dailami
Ashok Dhareshwar
Daniel Kaufmann
Nalin Kishor
Ramón López
Yan Wang

Published for the World Bank
Oxford University Press
CONTENTS

Foreword ................................................................. xiii
Preface ................................................................ xvii
The Report Team .......................................................... xxi
Overview ................................................................ xxiii
   Development Outcomes and Growth Processes ............. xxiii
   Principles of Development ....................................... xxv
   Neglected Actions in the Growth Process .................. xxix
   Shifting Priorities .................................................. xxxii

1. A Mixed Development Record ................................... 1
   Assessing Development ........................................... 2
   The Development Record ....................................... 5
   Growth and Welfare .............................................. 14
   External Factors Matter ....................................... 15
   Domestic Policies Make a Crucial Difference ............. 17
   Crucial Issues for Action ...................................... 21

2. Assets, Growth, and Welfare .................................... 27
   A Framework ...................................................... 28
   Empirical Evidence .............................................. 36
   Conclusions ...................................................... 44

3. Improving the Distribution of Opportunities ................ 49
   Potential Benefits of Education ............................... 50
   Quantity Is Not Enough—Quality Matters ................. 51
   Achieving Equitable Education and Social Inclusion .... 56
   Improving the Efficacy of Public Spending ................. 66
Making Education More Productive .............................................. 73
Conclusions .............................................................................. 80

4. Sustaining Natural Capital ...................................................... 83
   Extensive Losses ..................................................................... 84
   Significant Benefits of Environmental Action .............................. 88
   The Growth–Natural Capital–Welfare Nexus ............................... 89
   Incorporating Environmental Sustainability in Growth Policies ...... 98
   Rethinking the State's Role .................................................... 102
   Global Environmental Issues Must Be Confronted .................... 107
   Conclusions .............................................................................. 109

5. Dealing with Global Financial Risks ........................................... 113
   Expansion of Capital Markets and Volatility of Capital Flows .......... 114
   Causes and Consequences of Capital Flow Volatility .................. 115
   Past and Present Risk Management ............................................ 122
   A Broad Framework of Risk Management ..................................... 124
   Conclusions .............................................................................. 131

6. Governance and Anticorruption ............................................... 135
   Governance Affects the Quality of Growth ................................ 136
   Corruption Undermines Growth and Development ..................... 144
   Causes of Corruption ............................................................... 150
   A Multifaceted Anticorruption Strategy ...................................... 152
   Conclusions .............................................................................. 166

7. Seizing the Opportunities for Change ....................................... 169
   The Framework and Themes ..................................................... 169
   Actions to Ensure Quality ....................................................... 172
   Where Have the Policies for Quality Worked—or Not? ................. 174
   Political Economy of Quantity versus Quality ............................ 176
   Going Forward ......................................................................... 177

Bibliography and References ..................................................... 233

Annexes
1. Broad Objectives and Instruments .............................................. 179
   Goals and Policy Measures ..................................................... 179
   Composite Indexes of Human and Sustainable Development ........ 183

2. Framework and Evidence ....................................................... 185
   A Welfare Function ............................................................... 185
   Private Sector Optimization .................................................... 186
   Econometric Specification Used to Estimate Growth Functions ....... 196
3. Distribution of Education, Openness, and Growth ................ 205
   The Extended Production Function with Distribution
   of Education .................................................. 206
   Empirical Analysis on Education and Investment Returns .......... 209
   Selected Literature on Asset Distribution and Growth .......... 212

4. Measuring Natural Capital ........................................... 215

5. Financial Openness ................................................. 217
   Note on Country Vulnerability and Volatility Measures .......... 220
   Note on Gross Domestic Product Gaps .............................. 220
   Note on the Binomial Logit Model ..................................... 221
   Summary Statistics for Variables Used in Chapter 5 .............. 222

6. Governance and Corruption Indexes: Aggregation
   Methods, New Empirical Measures, and Econometric
   Challenges ...................................................... 225
   Defining and Unbundling Governance .................................. 225
   Measuring and Unbundling Corruption .................................. 228

Boxes
1. Asset Accumulation, Growth, and Welfare xxxvi
2.1 Social Capital .................................................................. 33
2.2 Alternative Approaches to Sustain Growth: Brazil, Chile,
   and the Republic of Korea ................................................. 37
3.1 Health Gaps between the Rich and the Poor Are also Large ..... 61
3.2 Supporting Girls' Education in Bangladesh ......................... 64
3.3 Population and Development ............................................. 71
4.1 Environmental Degradation in India .................................... 86
4.2 Worldwide Efforts for Environmental Action ....................... 90
4.3 Population, Poverty, and the Environment ........................... 94
4.4 Development and the Environment ...................................... 103
4.5 Private Profit at Public Expense: Corruption in the
   Forest Sector .......................................................... 107
4.6 International Cooperation to Mitigate Global Climate
   Change ....................................................................... 108
5.1 Openness to International Capital Flows ................................ 118
5.2 Chile: Openness, Capital Controls, and Social Protection ....... 130
6.1 Governance and Survey Diagnostic Tools: The Power
   of Empirics .............................................................. 161
6.2 "Voice" as a Mechanism to Enforce Transparency and
   Accountability .......................................................... 162
6.3 Millions of “Auditors” Improve Transparency and Governance
in Budgetary Accounts and Beyond ........................................... 165
7.1 Actions for Quality .......................................................... 173

Figures
1 A Framework ........................................................................... xxvii
1.1 GDP Growth and Changes in Quality of Life, 1960s and 1990s ... 4
1.2 Change in Human Development and Growth of Income,
1981–98 ................................................................................. 6
1.3 Poverty Rates and Number of Poor, Selected Years .............. 7
1.4 Poverty Incidence in Selected Transition Economies,
1987–88 and 1993–95 ............................................................. 8
1.5 Environmental Changes Versus Growth of Income, 1981–98 .... 8
1.6 Total Suspended Particulates, Selected Cities, Early 1990s ....... 9
1.7 Purchasing Power Parity–Adjusted GDP Per Capita, 1975–98 ... 10
1.8 Growth in GDP Per Capita, Selected Economies, 1975–98 ...... 11
1.9 Income Inequality within Countries: 1980s and 1990s .......... 13
1.10 Volatility of GDP Growth Rates by Decade ......................... 14
1.11 Public Expenditures on Education by Region, Selected Years ... 18
1.12 Trade Barriers, Selected Regions, 1984–93 .......................... 20
1.13 Parallel-Market Premium, 1970s–1990s .............................. 21
3.1 Relationship between Public Spending Per Capita and
Educational Attainment, Various Years .................................... 52
3.2 Secondary School Completion Rates for 20–25-Year-Olds
by Household Income Level, Selected Latin American
Countries and Years .............................................................. 56
3.3 Gini Coefficients of Education, Selected Countries, 1960–90 .... 58
3.4 Education Lorenz Curves for India and Korea, 1990 .............. 59
3.5 Education Gini Coefficients for 85 Countries, 1990 .............. 60
3.6 Mortality of Children Two Years Old and Younger by Wealth,
Brazil, 1996 ................................................................. 61
3.7 Median Grade Attainment for 15–19-Year-Olds from Rich
and Poor Households, Selected Countries and Years ............. 62
3.8 Years of Schooling for 25-Year-Olds from Rich and Poor
Households in Latin America .................................................. 63
3.9 Gender Gaps and the Inequality of Education, 1970 and 1990 ... 65
3.10 Trend Rates of Poverty Reduction and Nonfarm Output
Economic Growth in India, 1960–94 ......................................... 67
3.11a Poverty and Landholding, Bangladesh, 1988–89 .................. 74
3.11b Income Share in the 1980s and Land Gini Coefficients
in the 1960s ......................................................................... 74
CONTENTS

3.12 Education, Openness, and Economic Rates of Return in 1,265 World Bank Projects ........................................... 79
4.1 Growth Paths and Environmental Quality ........................................... 96
5.1 Global Financial Market Size and World Trade, 1980–96 ............. 115
5.2 The Rise and Fall of International Capital Flows, 1990–99 ............. 116
5.3 Relationship between Economic Growth Variability and Volatility in Private Foreign Capital Flows, 1975–96 .......... 120
5.4 Relationships among Democracy, Financial Openness, Capital Mobility, and Government Social Expenditures .......... 128
5.5 Relationship between Financial Openness and Social Expenditure ......................................................... 128
5.6 Country Classification: Political Rights and Financial Openness ......................................................... 129
6.1 Quality of Rule of Law Indicator: The “Traffic Lights” Presentational Approach ........................................ 140
6.2 Control of Corruption: The “Traffic Lights” Presentation Approach ......................................................... 142
6.3 The Development Dividend of Good Governance ................ 143
6.4 Corruption Is Regressive: Results from Diagnostic Surveys .......... 148
6.5 Corruption and Absence of Meritocracy in Public Agencies Impair Access to Services to the Poor: Results from Public Officials’ Diagnostic Surveys ........................................... 149
6.6 “Petty Bribery” versus State Capture: Does Engaging in Corruption Benefit the Firm? ........................................... 150
6.7 Corruption and Civil Rights ............................................................... 151
6.8 Meritocracy Can Reduce Corruption: Evidence for each Agency from Surveys of Public Officials in Three Countries .................................................................................. 153
6.9 Multipronged Strategies for Combating Corruption and Improving Governance: Recognizing the Political Economy ............................................................... 154
6.10 High Variation in the Quality of Courts in Selected Economies ................................................................. 158
6.11 Legal and Judicial Capture by the Corporate Sector in Selected Transition Economies ................................................................. 159
A1.1 Development Objectives and Policy Instruments .................. 181
A2.1 Constant Returns to Scale and No Technological Spillovers ..... 192
A2.2 Subsistence, Growth, and Poverty Traps among the Poor: The Case of Constant Returns to Scale and No Spillovers .......... 195
A 5.1 Correlations of Financial Openness with Political Rights and Civil Liberties ......................................................... 224
CONTENTS

Tables
1.1 Correlations of Measures of Development, 1981–98 ............................... 3
1.2 Development Outcomes by Growth Class, 1980s and 1990s .......... 15
1.3 External Factors Matter for Domestic Outcomes, Examples
from 1997–99 .............................................................................. 16
1.4 Policy Performance, by Growth Class, 1980s and 1990s ........... 22
2.1 Selected Variables for Brazil, Chile, and Korea ..................... 38
2.2 Review of Development Indicators for 60 Reformers and
Nonreformers, Selected Years ............................................. 39
3.1 Primary School Repetition and Dropout Rates,
Selected Years ..................................................................... 54
3.2 Public Spending by Level of Education, Korea,
Selected Years ..................................................................... 68
3.3 Public Expenditure Per Student by Level, 1960s to 1990s ....... 69
3.4 Public Current Expenditure Per Student, India and Korea,
Selected Years ..................................................................... 70
4.1 Annual Health Costs Associated with Air Pollution ............. 85
4.2 Annual Health Costs Associated with Waterborne Diseases
and Pollution .................................................................. 85
4.3 Trade, Growth, Poverty, and Environmental Degradation,
Selected Years ...................................................................... 92
4.4 Classification of Selected Countries by Growth-Environment
Trajectory ........................................................................ 97
4.5 Environmental Services of Costa Rican Forests and
Their Beneficiaries ............................................................... 98
5.2 Country Grouping by Financial Openness ....................... 127
5.3 Estimation Results of the Binomial Logit Model on the
Likelihood of Countries Belonging to the High Democracy
and High Financial Openness Categories ............................ 127
6.1 A Synthesis Matrix: Corruption and Poverty ..................... 147
6.2 Impact of Civil Liberties on Project Socioeconomic Rates
of Return ........................................................................ 164
A1.1 Relationships between Development Objectives and Policy
Instruments, 1981–98 ....................................................... 180
A2.1 The Growth Equation under Various Specifications........... 199
A2.2 GDP Growth Rates Regressed on Stocks Per Worker, Using
All Countries with Available Data from 1965 to 1990 .......... 200
A2.3 Elasticities for Stocks Per Worker on GDP per Capita
Growth Rates ..................................................................... 201
A2.4  Selected Empirical Studies on the Impact and Size of Capital Subsidies ......................................................... 202
A3.1  Gini Coefficients of Education for Selected Countries, Selected Years .......................................................... 207
A3.2  Production Function: Linear Estimation .......................................................... 208
A3.3  Production Function: Nonlinear Estimation .................................................... 210
A3.4  Education, Openness, and Lending Project Performance .............................. 212
A3.5  Selective Empirical Studies on Asset Distribution, Growth, and Poverty .................................................. 213
A5.1  International Transactions ............................................................................. 218
A5.2  Financial Openness Index, Selected Countries, 1997 ...................................... 219
A5.3  Developing Countries Classified by Degree of Volatility to Private Foreign Capital Flows ............................................. 221
A5.4  Summary Statistics for Selected Industrial and Developing Countries ................................................................. 223
A5.5  The Relationship among Financial Openness, Democracy, and Social Expenditure .................................................... 224
A6.1  Percentage of Firms Affected by Different Forms of State Capture, and Overall State Capture Index, Selected Countries, 1999 ...................................................... 231
FOREWORD

We have much to celebrate as we begin the new millennium. A child born today in the developing world can expect to live 25 years longer and be healthier, better-educated, and more productive than a child born 50 years ago. The spread of democracy has brought new freedoms and unprecedented opportunities for many people throughout the world. And the communications revolution holds the promise of universal access to knowledge.

But, if we take a closer look, we see something else—something alarming. In the developing countries, excluding China, at least 100 million more people are living in poverty today than a decade ago. And the gap between rich and poor yawns wider. In many countries the scourge of AIDS has cruelly cut life expectancy—in some African countries by more than 10 years. More than 1 billion people still lack access to safe water, and each year 2.4 million children die of waterborne diseases. As many as a billion people have entered the 21st century unable to read or write. Some 1.8 million people die every year of indoor air pollution in rural areas alone. Forests are being destroyed at the rate of an acre a second, with unimaginable loss of biodiversity.

Those are some measures of our shortcomings: that despite prosperity for some, the quality of life has remained bleak for many. In the face of almost two decades of rapid economic growth in some countries, others have not benefited from such progress. In many settings policies have favored vested interests of the elite, and thus not promoted adequate investments in human capital and natural capital, which are essential for broad-based growth. The quality of the factors contributing to growth requires fundamental attention if poverty is to be reduced and a better quality of life attained by all. This is the central theme of this book.
A better quality of life for the poor calls for higher incomes. This requires sound economic policies and institutions conducive to sustained growth. Achieving higher incomes and a better quality of life also calls for much more—improved and more equitable opportunities for education and jobs, better health and nutrition, a cleaner and more sustainable natural environment, an impartial judicial and legal system, greater civil and political liberties, trustworthy and transparent institutions, and freedom of access to a rich and diverse cultural life. The World Bank’s recent book *Voices of the Poor: Can Anyone Hear Us?* reinforces this message. Poor women and men from around the world noted emphatically the importance of dignity, respect, security, gender issues, a clean environment, health, and inclusion in addition to material well-being.

As incomes per capita rise, several aspects of quality of life improve as well, but not all, not at the same rate, and not inevitably. In different countries the same pace of economic growth has been associated with very different degrees of improvements over time in education, health, civil liberties, citizens’ participation in the decisions affecting their lives, freedom from corruption, and environmental quality and sustainability. This book demonstrates that how growth is generated and whether it is sustainable matter crucially for the quality of life of everyone.

The World Bank’s strategy is to design and evaluate its activities through the lens of poverty reduction, the vision that informs the Comprehensive Development Framework we have embraced in the countries we work with. This framework encourages countries to pursue a balanced approach to development, simultaneously trying to augment the human, social, natural, and physical dimensions. Only then are the fruits of development widely shared and sustained.

In aligning these complementary dimensions, this integrated framework also attempts to bring together the key development actors. It puts institutions, governance, corporate responsibility, and issues of inclusion, voice, liberties, and participation on par with conventional economic concerns and policymaking. In addressing these related issues simultaneously, the framework emphasizes the need for the country’s leadership, as well as for partnership among government, the private sector, civil society, and the international community, in driving the development agenda. We are committed to assisting this framework not only with financing, but increasingly also with state-of-the-art learning and knowledge programs using new data, toolkits, and methodologies, and supported by the latest information and communication technologies.

Indeed, travelling throughout all continents I am constantly reminded by the people—in rural villages and overcrowded urban centers alike—that
the quality of life for them transcends the contribution of just financing. That quality is about access for girls and boys to education, and to jobs when they graduate. It is about access for the rural poor to basic medicine when they go to their village clinic. It is about the cleanliness of the air and water and about protecting the precious biodiversity. It is about the dignity the poor might enjoy and the security of their lives. It is about the participation of people along with reformers in the government in implementing an anticorruption program. It is about fighting the vested interests of an economic elite that unduly influences, or even purchases, the policies, regulations, and laws of the state.

This volume makes a compelling case for focusing on these policy and institutional dimensions, and for doing so with country ownership and partnership among participants in the development process. Investing in people, sustaining natural resources, managing risks, and improving governance, it shows, are dimensions that make up quality growth. It is more of such growth that can best promote poverty reduction, environmentally and socially sustainable development, and an improved quality of life shared by all.

James D. Wolfensohn
President
The World Bank Group
PREFACE

The 1990s—at the end of a century and a millennium—were a period of stocktaking about development. Studies reexamined and assessed some of the central tenets of development. Sustained economic growth emerged unscathed as fundamental for reducing poverty. And the development record confirmed the efficacy of certain reforms for sustaining growth in both developing and industrial countries: investing more—and more efficiently—in education and health, reducing barriers to trade and investment, dismantling domestic price controls in agriculture and industry, and reducing fiscal deficits. Neither the economic ups nor the downs of the 1990s called these relationships into question.

The assessments also uncovered some crucial gaps. Missing from country policymaking as well as the advice, conditions, and financing of external entities has been adequate attention to the quality and sustainability of growth. Without that, the real potential of reforms cannot be realized.

And the assessments highlighted some profound changes in development thinking over the past 50 years as our understanding of development processes has matured, shaped by experience. Not that interpretations have been entirely uniform. For example, some have understood the “Washington consensus” solely as a policy prescription for liberalizing markets. Others have accepted the extended interpretation of the World Development Report 1991’s market-friendly approach as a market-plus view, involving both liberalization and a strong, positive role for the state and other stakeholders.

Differing interpretations aside, the assessments show an emerging consensus on some key lessons about complementarity and balance among
policies and institutions. Functioning markets and liberalization are crucial. But so is acknowledging the limits of the market and an essential role for governments and other stakeholders in the reform process.

Sometimes expectations based on experience have been borne out, sometimes not. Early discussions predicted the success of such natural resource-rich countries as Myanmar, the Philippines, and some in Africa and the failure of such natural resource-poor economies as the Republic of Korea or Singapore. Expectations of rapid development through market liberalization in the transition economies failed to materialize. And in the 1980s, the slowdown of productivity growth in North American and European industrial economies contrasted with the marked success of Japan, prompting calls for changes in the growth paradigm.

Sometimes reality fell short of expectations because changes in global and local circumstances blunted the impact of actions and forced governments to revise priorities. “Heavy industries first” seemed the best way forward at the turn of the 19th century; information technology seems to be the key to success at the turn of the 20th. And as markets were liberalized in recent decades, sometimes disappointing outcomes exposed the importance of institution building to make markets work.

We present this book in this spirit of continuous inquiry and feedback in framing development thinking. It is addressed to policymakers, practitioners, and others in developing as well as industrial countries. It reaffirms the crucial contribution of market-friendly policies. It also highlights key missing ingredients and fresh evidence. Not a complete review of development, the book examines vital issues that are often overlooked as a basis for action: the distribution of opportunities, especially education; environmental sustainability; management of risks; and governance and anticorruption. It does not address such important factors as the political economy of change, the influence of social instability, the consequences of communicable diseases such as HIV/AIDS, or the impact of cross-border and global issues—population pressures, labor migration, global warming, information technology, and the global financial and business architecture. It concludes that growth is crucial, and so is the quality of growth.

The work for this book was carried out by a team at the World Bank Institute. The work was supported by a research grant from the World Bank as a contribution to the learning material for a course on development as well as background for the World Development Report 1999/2000: Entering the 21st Century and the World Development Report 2000/2001: Attacking Poverty. It was inspired by a keynote paper and discussion by Stanley...

The team thanks the following for their inputs to the volume: Montek Ahluwalia, Jane Armitage, Kaushik Basu, Surjit Bhalla, Jan Bojo, Deepak Bhattacharya, Gerard Caprio, Shaohua Chen, Kevin Cleaver, Maureen Cropper, Monica Dasgupta, Shanta Devarajan, Ishac Diwan, David Dollar, William Easterly, Gershon Feder, Andrew Feltenstein, Deon Filmer, Pablo Guerrero, Cielito Habito, Kirk Hamilton, Jeffrey Hammer, Joseph Ingram, Farrukh Iqbal, Ramachandra Jhammi, Emmanuel Jimenez, Mary Judd, Philip E. Keefer, Homi Kharas, Elizabeth M. King, Kathie Krumm, Ashok Lahiri, Kyung Tae Lee, Andres Liebenthal, Magda Lovei, Muthukumara Mani, Michele de Nevers, David Nepomuceno, Jostein Nygard, Michael Pomerleano, Tanaporn Poshyananda, Lant Pritchett, Martin Ravallion, David Reed, Neil Roger, William Shaw, Mary Shirley, Ammar Siamwalla, Hadi Soesastro, T. G. Srinivasan, Tara Vishwanath, Christina Wood, Michael Woolcock, Roberto Zagha, and discussants and participants in seminars at the International Monetary Fund/World Bank Annual Meetings, the National Council of Applied Economic Research (India), Asian Development Forum (Singapore), Thailand Development Research Institute, as well as a presentation at an International Monetary Fund conference on reforms. Several units of the World Bank reviewed the manuscript.
This work was carried out by a team at the World Bank Institute led by Vinod Thomas and comprising Mansoor Dailami (chapter 5), Ashok Dhareshwar (chapter 1), Daniel Kaufmann (chapter 6), Nalin Kishor (chapter 4), Ramón E. López (chapter 2), and Yan Wang (chapter 3 and task manager). The team was assisted in its research by Cary Anne Cadman, Xibo Fan, and John Van Dyck. Taji Anderson, Alice Faria, and Jae Shin Yang provided support.

Bruce Ross-Larson and Meta de Coquereaumont of Communications Development Incorporated and International Communications, Inc. (ICI) of Sterling, Virginia, edited the manuscript at different stages. ICI also provided typesetting and proofreading. Product development, design, editing, production, and dissemination were directed and managed by the World Bank’s Office of the Publisher.