

WORLD BANK LATIN AMERICAN
AND CARIBBEAN STUDIES

Viewpoints

SECURING OUR
FUTURE IN
A GLOBAL
ECONOMY

by

David de Ferranti

Guillermo E. Perry

Indermit S. Gill

Luis Servén

with

Francisco H.G. Ferreira

Nadeem Ilahi

William F. Maloney

Martin Rama

**THE WORLD BANK
WASHINGTON, D.C.**

Copyright © 2000
The International Bank for Reconstruction
and Development/THE WORLD BANK
1818 H Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A.

All rights reserved
Manufactured in the United States of America
First printing June 2000

The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this paper are entirely those of the author(s) and should not be attributed in any manner to the World Bank, to its affiliated organizations, or to members of its Board of Executive Directors or the countries they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this publication and accepts no responsibility whatsoever for any consequence of their use. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this volume do not imply on the part of the World Bank Group any judgment on the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

The material in this publication is copyrighted. Requests for permission to reproduce portions of it should be sent to the Office of the Publisher at the address shown in the copyright notice above. The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally give permission promptly and, when the reproduction is for noncommercial purposes, without asking a fee. Permission to copy portions for classroom use is granted through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., Suite 910, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Massachusetts 01923, U.S.A.

David de Ferranti is vice president and Guillermo E. Perry is chief economist in the World Bank's Latin America and the Caribbean Regional Office. Indermit S. Gill is lead economist and Luis Servén is lead specialist in the World Bank's Latin America and the Caribbean Regional Office. Francisco Ferreira is professor of economics at the Pontifical Catholic University-Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. Nadeem Ilahi is an economist with the International Monetary Fund. William F. Maloney is senior economist in the World Bank's Latin America and the Caribbean Regional Office, and Martin Rama is senior economist in the World Bank's Development Research Group.

Cover design by Janelle Welch/The Magazine Group

Cover photography—Globe: NASA Goddard Space Flight Center; Inset photos, clockwise from top: Catherine de Torquat/Sygma; Bill Pogue/Stone; Robert Frerck/Stone; Margo Pinkerton/Liaison Agency.

de Ferranti, David.

Securing our future in a global economy

Guillermo E. Perry.

p. cm. — (World Bank Latin American and Caribbean Studies.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-8213-4730-6

Library of Congress pending

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Acronyms and Abbreviations	xi
Chapter 1: Opportunity and Risk in a Globalized Latin America and the Caribbean.	1
Latin America and the Caribbean's Performance Improved in the 1990s	1
Opportunities and Risks.	1
Why Economic Insecurity?	3
This Report	6
LAC's Volatility is High—But has not Risen in the 1990s.	6
Dealing with Economic Insecurity Requires a Comprehensive Insurance Approach	7
LAC's Volatility Arises from Multiple Sources—Domestic and Foreign.	7
Governments Can Do Much to Reduce Volatility—Even in a Globalized Economy	7
External Risks Can Be Reduced by Diversification and Liquidity Management	8
Anticyclical Macroeconomic Policies Ease Adjustment to Shocks	8
Deeper and Stronger Financial Systems Are a Key Part of Social Protection Policies.	8
Deep Crises are Particularly Damaging for the Poor.	8
The Poor Try to Protect Their Long-Term Welfare in Crises—As Long as Their Assets Permit.	9
New Income Support Programs for the Unemployed Need to be Established.	9
Administrative Capacity and Labor Policies are Key in the Choice of Instruments	9
Self-Insurance for Slow-Reforming Economies	10
Unemployment Insurance for Advanced Reforming Economies.	10
Public Works Programs Provide Insurance Support for Informal Sector Workers	10
Targeted Programs for the Poor Need to be Better Protected in Downturns.	10
Save in Good Times to Finance Social Spending in Bad Times	10
Supranational Action and the Role of the International Financial Institutions	11
Myths and Realities About Economic Volatility.	11
Securing Our Future.	11
Notes	11
Chapter 2: Economic Insecurity in Latin America and the Caribbean: The Stylized Facts.	13
Methodological Considerations	13
Aggregate Volatility in Latin America	15
Volatility in Aggregate Output.	15
Volatility in Aggregate Consumption	15
Differences in Volatility Across Countries Within the Region	16
Regional Trends in Economic Volatility	18
Transmission of Aggregate Volatility to the Labor Market.	21
Are Latin American Workers Facing More Risk?	23
Changes in Earnings Volatility	23
Trends in Unemployment Rates	24
Changes in Turnover Rates	26
Rise in Informality.	27

The Deterioration in Prospects of Older Workers	31
Changes in Income Distribution	32
Conclusion	32
Notes	35
Chapter 3: Designing Social Policy When People Face Risk: A Conceptual Framework	37
The Need for Sound Analysis	37
Approach and Implications	38
Advantages of a Disciplined Approach	39
Clearer Rationale for Government Action	42
Useful Insights	42
A Powerful Tool for Organization	43
Conclusion	43
Notes	44
Chapter 4: Macroeconomic Volatility in Latin America and the Caribbean: Causes and Remedies	45
Sources of Aggregate Volatility in LAC	45
External Shocks	45
Macroeconomic Policy Volatility	49
Absorption and Amplification of Shocks: The Importance of Financial Markets	50
Weak Links with World Financial Markets	52
Shallow Domestic Financial Markets	53
The Combination Increases the Likelihood of Economic Crises	54
Other Amplification Mechanisms	57
Summary	61
Policies to Deal with Aggregate Volatility in LAC	61
Terms of Trade Risk	65
Capital Flows	66
The Financial System	67
Fiscal Policy	67
Monetary and Exchange Rate Policy	67
Supranational Action	68
Annex 1	68
Notes	70
Chapter 5: The Response of LAC Households to Economic Shocks	73
The Risk of Unemployment: Who is Most Affected?	73
Are the Poor Most Likely to Become Unemployed?	73
Are Older, Less-Educated Men More Likely to Become Unemployed?	73
Is There No Unemployment in the Informal Sector?	74
Who Becomes Unemployed and for How Long?	76
Household Responses to Income Shocks: Findings of Panel Studies	76
Do Aggregate Shocks Hurt the Poor More than the Rich?	78
Does Ownership of Assets Reduce Vulnerability to Aggregate Shocks?	79
Do the Poor Engage in Self-Destructive or Myopic Coping?	81
Are All Downturns the Same in their Effects?	83
Conclusion	85
Notes	86
Chapter 6: Helping Workers Deal with the Risk of Unemployment.	89
A Typology of Programs	90
Main Findings	92
Who Is Covered by these Programs?	95
How Much Do the Programs Cost?	96
What Are the Efficiency Effects and Insurance Benefits?	97
What Are the Main Weaknesses of these Programs?	98
Policy Implications	98
Self-Protection: The State of Labor Markets	99
Self-Insurance: Individual Savings Accounts	99

“Market-Type” Insurance: Risk-Pooling Programs	101
Severance Pay Provisions as Insurance for Unemployment.	102
Public Works Programs as Insurance for Unemployment	102
“Conventional” Unemployment Insurance	103
Conclusion	107
Notes	108
Chapter 7: Helping Poor Households Deal Better with Economic Crises.	111
Social Spending Over Economic Cycles	113
How Do Governments Vary Spending Over the Economic Cycle?	113
The Importance of Political Factors.	114
The Quality of Social Services Over the Cycle	116
Targeted Spending During Booms and Busts	119
Designing Economic Policy Under Political Constraints	121
The Long-Term Goal of Social Policy Must be to Improve the Distribution of Assets.	122
Targeted Programs Should be Permanent and Better Protected During Crises	122
Keeping Increases in Social Spending Moderate in Good Times is Important Too.	122
International Financial Institutions Can Help Overcome Political Constraints to Insurance	122
Conclusion	123
Notes	125
Bibliography	127
Boxes	
Box 2.1 Defining and Measuring Insecurity	14
Box 2.2 Trends in Aggregate Volatility in Latin America and the Caribbean	20
Box 2.3 Why Might Workers Prefer to be Precarious or Unprotected?	31
Box 2.4 Income Mobility and Risk in Two Countries	34
Box 3.1 Market Insurance, Self-Insurance, and Self-Protection: Distinguishing Features and Examples	39
Box 3.2 A Theory of Comprehensive Insurance.	40
Box 3.3 The Framework in “Real Life” Situations.	41
Box 4.1 Excess Sensitivity to Disturbances: The Case of Chile.	52
Box 4.2 Weak Financial Markets and Volatility: A Framework	59
Box 4.3 The Welfare Cost of Volatility and the Gains from International Risk-Sharing	62
Box 5.1 Informal Self-Employment: Precarious Workers or Voluntary Entrepreneurs?	75
Box 5.2 Data Sets and Methodologies Used	77
Box 5.3 Where Does Time Go During a Crisis?	83
Box 5.4 Do Families Mortgage Their Children’s Future? Other Evidence.	86
Box 6.1 Income Support Programs for the Unemployed: Main Features.	91
Box 6.2 Data Sources and Methodology	94
Box 6.3 Labor Markets: Latin America’s “Forgotten Reform”.	100
Box 6.4 Combining Mandated Self-Insurance and Market-Type Unemployment Insurance	102
Box 6.5 Who Really Pays for Unemployment Insurance?	105
Box 6.6 Some Guidelines for Countries that Have Unemployment Systems	107
Box 7.1 How Do Pro-Poor Governments Vary Spending Over the Economic Cycle?	114
Box 7.2 Data Sources and Classification into Targeted and Social Spending	115
Box 7.3 Social Spending Over Economic and Political Cycles in Latin America	116
Box 7.4 Colombia’s Healthcare Reform	118
Box 7.5 Mexico’s <i>Progres</i> a Program: Works Well, But Would it Do as Well in Crises?	120
Box 7.6 Social Programs, Entitlements, and Countercyclicality in the U.S.	124
Tables	
Table 1.1 Per Capita GDP Growth in Latin America (Percent)	2
Table 1.2 Per Capita Private Consumption Growth in Latin America (Percent)	3
Table 1.3 Survey Responses in Latin American Countries on Expected Changes in Living Standards (Percentages Unless Otherwise Noted)	4
Table 1.4 Survey Responses to Social Insurance-Related Questions in 14 Latin American Countries, by Socioeconomic Category (Percentages Unless Otherwise Noted).	4
Table 1.5 Economic Insecurity: Twelve Myths	12

Table 2.1	Long-Term Volatility in Latin America (Standard Deviations of Growth Rates, Percent)	16
Table 2.2	Volatility in Latin America Over Time (Standard Deviations of Growth Rates by Decade, Percent).	21
Table 2.3	Real Wage Growth Volatility in Latin America and the Caribbean, Percent	24
Table 2.4	Average Unemployment Rates in Latin America and the Caribbean, Percent	25
Table 2.5	Labor Turnover, LAC and OECD Countries	28
Table 2.6	Income Inequality Measures by Country, 1986–96.	33
Table 3.1	Government Policies and Their Effect on Individual Comprehensive Insurance	44
Table 4.1	Volatility in Terms of Trade Shocks for Selected Latin American Countries	47
Table 4.2	Estimated Welfare Gains from Diversification (Latin America and the Caribbean, Percent of Private Annual Consumption).	63
Table 4.3	International Portfolio Diversification (Ratios to Total Wealth).	64
Table 4.4	An Overview of Policies to Deal with Aggregate Volatility	65
Table 4.A.1	Empirical Determinants of GDP Growth Volatility (Dependent Variable: Standard Deviation of GDP Growth, 1975–99).	69
Table 5.1	Unemployment Rates by Household Income and Consumption Quintile	74
Table 5.2	Unemployment Rates by Age, Education, and Gender	74
Table 5.3	Annual Probability of Becoming Unemployed from Formal and Informal Work (Percent)	75
Table 5.4	Income Variance of Formal Salaried vs. Self-Employed Workers (Theil Index)	76
Table 5.5	Unemployment Duration, in Years	76
Table 5.6	Metropolitan Brazil: Percentage Income Changes by Head's Wage Bracket	79
Table 5.7	Mexico: Proportional Income Change by Income Quintile, 1995–96.	80
Table 5.8	Rural El Salvador: A Dynamic Decomposition of Poverty Changes, 1995–97	80
Table 6.1	How Various Income Support Programs for the Unemployed Work	92
Table 6.2	Contrasting the Brazilian and U.S. Unemployment Insurance Systems	93
Table 6.3	Income Support Programs for the Unemployed: Beneficiaries Across Population Groups	95
Table 6.4	Income Support Programs for the Unemployed: Costs per Beneficiary	97
Table 6.5	Income Support Programs for the Unemployed: Effects on Employment, Earnings, and Consumption	98
Table 6.6	Costs of Unemployment Insurance: Burden-Sharing Among Workers, Employers, and Government	104
Table 6.7	Income Support Programs for the Unemployed: Summary of Findings and Policy Implications	106
Table 7.1	Targeted Public Spending per Poor Person in Argentina and Mexico, 1994–96	113
Table 7.2	Elasticities of Spending to Growth, by Type of Spending	116
Table 7.3	Changes in Latin American Social Protection Spending, 1970–95 (Broad Spending Categories)	117
Table 7.4	Main Characteristics of Targeted Conditional Transfers.	119
Figures		
Figure 1.1	Per Capita GDP Growth (Regional Medians).	2
Figure 1.2	Per Capita Private Consumption Growth (Regional Medians).	3
Figure 2.1	Long-Term Volatility of Real GDP Growth.	15
Figure 2.2	Long-Term Volatility of Real Private Consumption Growth	15
Figure 2.3	GDP Growth Volatility and Country Size	17
Figure 2.4	GDP Growth Volatility and Per Capita Income	17
Figure 2.5	GDP Growth Volatility and Private Consumption Growth Volatility	18
Figure 2.6	Volatility of Real GDP Growth by Decade (Regional Medians)	19
Figure 2.7	Volatility of Real Private Consumption Growth by Decade (Regional Medians).	19
Figure 2.8	Volatility of Growth of GDP and Private Consumption in Latin America (Ten-Year Window, Regional Medians).	20
Figure 2.9	The Links Between Aggregate and Microeconomic Volatility	22
Figure 2.10	Long-Run Own Wage Elasticities, 1980–95, Chile	22
Figure 2.11	Wage and Unemployment Okun Coefficients.	23
Figure 2.12	White- and Blue-Collar Wage Volatility, Mexico	24
Figure 2.13	White- and Blue-Collar Wage Volatility, Argentina.	25
Figure 2.14	Unemployment Rate and Expected Duration, Montevideo	26
Figure 2.15	Unemployment Rate and Expected Duration, Interior Uruguay	26
Figure 2.16a	Unemployment Rate and Expected Duration, Greater Santiago	27
Figure 2.16b	Labor Turnover, LAC and OECD Countries	28
Figure 2.17	Evolution of Turnover in Chile, 1980–95	28
Figure 2.18	Evolution of Turnover in Colombia, 1980–91	29
Figure 2.19	Expected Tenure in Current Job, Montevideo (Months)	29

Figure 2.20	Expected Tenure in Current Job, Interior Uruguay (Months)	30
Figure 2.21	Expected Tenure on Job, Greater Santiago	30
Figure 2.22	Self-Employment versus Industrial Productivity, OECD and LAC.	31
Figure 2.23	Growth and Income Mobility in Argentina	34
Figure 2.24	Growth and Income Mobility in Mexico	35
Figure 4.1	Volatility in Terms of Trade Growth (Regional Medians)	46
Figure 4.2	Share in Total Exports of Four Most Important Commodities (Selected LAC Countries)	46
Figure 4.3	Volatility of Terms of Trade Shocks by Decade (Regional Medians)	47
Figure 4.4	Median Private Gross Capital Flows to Latin America (Percent of GDP)	48
Figure 4.5	Spread of Foreign-Currency-Denominated Sovereign Debt Instruments (bps) (Selected Major Latin American Countries)	48
Figure 4.6	Coefficient of Variation of Gross Private Capital Flows (Percent of GDP, Regional Medians).	49
Figure 4.7	Volatility of Reserve Money Growth (Regional Medians)	50
Figure 4.8	Volatility of Public Consumption Growth (Regional Medians)	50
Figure 4.9	Monetary Volatility and Fiscal Volatility	51
Figure 4.10	Fiscal Volatility and Terms of Trade Volatility	51
Figure 4.11	Chile's Excess Sensitivity to Shocks	52
Figure 4.12	Copper Prices and Chile's Current Account	53
Figure 4.13	Average Private Domestic Credit (Percent of GDP, Regional Medians)	54
Figure 4.14	Stock Market Capitalization and Turnover Ratios (Regional Medians in Percent, 1990–98)	54
Figure 4.15	Stock Market Capitalization and Turnover Ratios for Selected LAC Countries, 1995–98, Averages	55
Figure 4.16	Stock Market Illiquidity (Regression Coefficient of Absolute Price Changes on Trade Volume)	55
Figure 4.17	GDP Volatility and Credit Depth	56
Figure 4.18	Credit Crunches in Argentina	57
Figure 4.19	Credit Crunches in Brazil	57
Figure 4.20	Credit Crunches in Mexico	58
Figure 4.21	Fire Sales	60
Figure 4.22	Excess Vulnerability	60
Figure 4.23	Why is Latin America More Volatile than Industrial and East Asian Countries?	61
Figure 5.1	Income Gains and Losses in Seven Episodes of Volatility in Brazil.	79
Figure 5.2	El Salvador: Cumulative Distributions of Real Income Per Capita, 1995 and 1997	81
Figure 5.3	Brazil: Moves Into and Out of Poverty, by Level of Education a. Into Poverty During Growth b. Into Poverty During Recession c. Out of Poverty During Growth d. Out of Poverty During Recession	82 82 82 82
Figure 5.4	Change in Housework Time Due to Labor Force Entry	83
Figure 5.5	Brazil: Probability of School Dropout	84
Figure 5.6	Brazil: Probability of Repeating a Grade at School	84
Figure 5.7	Brazil: Probability of Child Aged 10–15 Starting Work	84
Figure 6.1	Workers Pay for UI even Though the Contributions are Levied on Firms	105
Figure 6.2	Workers and Firms Share UI Costs even Though Contributions are Levied on Firms	105
Figure 7.1	Targeted Social Spending Over the Economic Cycle	112

Acknowledgments

THIS REPORT IS THE RESULT OF A COLLECTIVE EFFORT BY A WORLD BANK TEAM COORDINATED by the Office of the Chief Economist for Latin America and the Caribbean region and led by Guillermo Perry. Main authors by chapter were Guillermo Perry (Chapter 1), Indermit S. Gill (Chapters 1, 3, 5, 6, and 7), Luis Servén (Chapters 1, 2 and 4), William F. Maloney (Chapters 2 and 5), Nadeem Ilahi (Chapters 3 and 7), Francisco H. G. Ferreira (Chapter 5), and Martin Rama (Chapter 6).

At the World Bank, major contributions were made by Wendy Cunningham, Gabriel Gonzalez, Emily Gustafsson-Wright, Norman Hicks, William Jack, Pedro Olinto, Bernadette Ryan, Guilherme Sedlacek, Rashmi Shankar, Mark Thomas, and Quentin Wodon. Outside contributors included Carlos Arango (University of Illinois), Ricardo Caballero (MIT), Jonathan Conning (Williams College), Adriana D. Kugler (Universitat Pompeu Fabra), Donna MacIsaac (consultant), Alejandra Mizala (Universidad de Chile), Marcelo Neri (Fundação Getulio Vargas), Martin Ravallion (Université des Sciences Sociales, Toulouse), Dani Rodrik (Harvard University), Pilar Romaguera (Universidad de Chile), James M. Snyder (MIT), Alvaro Trigueros (Universidad Centroamericana, San Salvador), and Irene Yackovlev (MIT).

Valuable comments were received from Ian Bannon, Suman Bery, François Bourguignon, Ariel Fiszbein, Marcelo Giugale, Gillette Hall, Emmanuel Y. Jimenez, Steen Jorgensen, Homi Kharas, Kathie Krumm, Klaus Schmidt-Hebbel, and Michael Walton.

The report also benefited from the comments and suggestions provided by participants at the Forum on Poverty, Vulnerability, and Inequality held in Lima in August 1999. Special thanks to Katherine Bain for facilitating the report team's participation at the Forum. Valuable comments were also received at the Latin America Economists' Retreat held in Baltimore in November 1999.

The report team was advised by a Steering Committee consisting of Robert Holzmann, Gobind T. Nankani, and Dani Rodrik. Xavier Coll, Ana-Maria Arriagada, Charles Griffin, and Donald R. Winkler also provided guidance and support.

However, any errors or omissions in the report are the sole responsibility of the authors and should not be attributed to any of the above individuals or the institutions they represent.

Finally, Diane Stamm, Christopher Neal, and Lee Morrison made a superb effort to see this publication through the final stages of production.

Acronyms and Abbreviations

ECLAC	Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
EDS	Encuesta de Desarrollo Social
ENEU	National Urban Employment Survey
ENH	Encuesta Nacional de Hogares
EPH	Permanent Household Survey
FDI	Foreign direct investment
FGTS	Fundo Garantia por Tempo de Servicio
FHIS	Social investment fund
FONASA	Fondo Nacional de Salud (formerly SERMENA)
GDP	Gross domestic product
GNP	Gross national product
IA	Individual savings accounts
IBGE	Brazilian Statistical Institute
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IFI	International financial institution
IFPRI	International Food Policy Research Institute
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMF	International Monetary Fund
ISAPRE	Instituciones de Salud Previsional
LAC	Latin America and the Caribbean
LSMS	Living Standards Measurement Survey
NIC	Newly industrialized country
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PETI	Programa de Erradicação do Trabalho Infantil
PME	Monthly Employment Survey
PNAD	Pesquisa Nacional de Amostra de Domicílios
PRAF II	Programa de Asignacion Familiar, Second Phase
PW	Public works
SP	Mandatory severance pay
SIMCE	Sistema de Medicion de la Calidad de la Ensenanza
SUS	Sistema Unico de Saude
TG	Training for the unemployed
UI	Unemployment insurance